BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 09565728 4

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

# CRIMINAL LAW

**Alan Brudner**

## VOLUME I

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

STORAGE

KE
8808.5
.B78
2014
v.1
c.1

2014-2015

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 2 1 2014

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# CRIMINAL LAW

**Alan Brudner**

## VOLUME I

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

2014-2015

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/criminallaw01brud_5

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

## (Volume I)


**Chapter One: The Aims of Punishment**

Bentham, Principles of Morals and Legislation ..... 1

C.S. Lewis, "The Humanitarian Theory of Punishment" ..... 5

Alan Brudner, "*Commentary*: In Defence of Retributivism" ..... 9

**Chapter Two: The Principle of Legality**

*Shaw v. Director of Public Prosecutions* ..... 13

*R. v. Nova Scotia Pharmaceutical Society* ..... 20

**Chapter Three: The Presumption of Innocence**

*Woolmington v. D.P.P.* ..... 27

*R. v. Oakes* ..... 32

*R. v. Whyte* ..... 39

*Downey v. The Queen* ..... 46

*R. v. Lifchus* ..... 55

**Chapter Four: Actus Reus**

*R. v. Corrier* ..... 61

*R. v. Williams* ..... 64

**A) Voluntariness**

*Rex v. Larsonneur* ..... 72

*Killbride v. Lake* ..... 73

**B) Omissions**

A Penal Code Prepared by the Indian Law Commissioners ..... 75

*People v. Beardsley* ..... 77

*The Queen v. Instan* ..... 81

*Fagan v. Commissioner of Metropolitan Police* ..... 83

*R. v. Miller* ..... 86

LRCC, Working Paper #46, Omissions ..... 88

### C) Causation

*R. v. Winning* ..... 91
*Commonwealth v. Moyer* ..... 91
*R. v. Roberts* ..... 94
*The Queen v. Jordan* ..... 96
*R. v. Smith* ..... 98
*People v. Lewis* ..... 101
*Pagett v. The Queen* ..... 102
The American Law Institute's Model Penal Code ..... 104
*R. v. Cheshire* ..... 105
*R. v. Smithers* ..... 110
*R. v. Blaue* ..... 111
*R. v. Cribbin* ..... 114
*R. v. Nette* ..... 121
*R. v Maybin* ..... 137

## Chapter Five: Inchoate Crimes

### I. Attempts

#### A) Intent

*Lajoie v. The Queen* ..... 149
*R. v. Ancio* ..... 153

#### B) Actus Reus

*The King v. Robinson* ..... 159
*The King v. Barker* ..... 162
*R. v. Cline* ..... 166
*R. v. Sorrell and Bondett* ..... 171
*Deutsch v. The Queen* ..... 176
LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 180

#### C) The Relevance of Impossibility

*R. v. Scott* ..... 182
*R. v. Smith (Roger)* ..... 183
*R. v. Shivpuri* ..... 187

*USA v. Dynar* ..... 193

**II. Counselling**

*R. v. McLeod et al.* ..... 209

*R. v. Hamilton.* ..... 210

LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 216

**Chapter Six: Mens Rea**

*R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie* ..... 218

Barbara Wooton, Crime and the Criminal Law ..... 218

H.L.A. Hart, Punishment and Responsibility ..... 221

**A) Intention and Motive**

*Lewis v. The Queen* ..... 226

*R. v. Steane* ..... 231

*Dunbar v. The King* ..... 233

*Paquette v. The Queen* ..... 235

*R. v. Hibbert* ..... 237

**B) Recklessness**

*R. v. Caldwell* ..... 251

*R. v. G and another* ..... 254

*R. v. Tutton and Tutton* ..... 264

*R. v. A.D.H.* ..... 275

*R. v. Hundal* ..... 284

*R v. Beatty* ..... 291

*R v. Roy* ..... 305

Brenda M. Baker, "Mens Rea & Negligence" ..... 314

*R v. Briscoe* ..... 317

American Law Institute's Model Penal Code ..... 319

**Chapter Seven: Departures from Mens Rea**

**A) Constructive Murder**

*R. v. Vaillancourt* ..... 321

The Law Reform Commission of Canada Working Paper 33, Homicide ..... 332

LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 335

*R. v. Martineau* ..... 336

**B) Foreseeability of Harm**

*R. v. DeSousa* ..... 348

*R. v. Creighton* ..... 356

**C) Strict and Absolute Liability**

Morris and Howard, "Strict Responsibility" ..... 379

*Rex v. Ping Yuen* ..... 382

*Beaver v. The Queen* ..... 384

*R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie* ..... 389

*Reference Re: Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act* ..... 395

*Wholesale Travel Group Inc. v. The Queen* ..... 401

**Chapter Eight: Parties to Offences**

*R. v. Kulbacki* ..... 431

*R. v. Salajko* ..... 432

*Dunlop and Sylvester v. The Queen* ..... 433

*R. v. Jackson* ..... 439

*R. v. Bainbridge* ..... 441

*R. v. Logan et al.* ..... 443

LRCC Draft Criminal Code ..... 450